



**MINUTES OF THE MEETING**  
**ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE**  
**THURSDAY, JANUARY 4, 2024**

THE FOLLOWING MINUTES ARE A SUMMARY OF ACTIONS TAKEN BY THE ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE (EEC). A DIGITAL RECORDING OF THE ACTUAL MEETING IS AVAILABLE AT: <http://scag.iqm2.com/Citizens/>.

The Energy and Environment Committee (EEC) of the Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) held its regular meeting both in person and virtually (telephonically and electronically). A quorum was present.

**Members Present**

**Sup. Luis Plancarte (Vice Chair)**

- Hon. Ana Beltran
- Hon. Art Bishop
- Hon. Phil Brock
- Hon. Margaret Clark
- Hon. Robert Copeland
- Hon. Jenny Crosswhite
- Hon. Ned Davis
- Hon. Rick Denison
- Hon. Shari Horne
- Hon. Britt Huff
- Hon. Dan Kalmick
- Hon. Joe Kalmick
- Hon. Elaine Litster
- Hon. Vianey Lopez
- Hon. Lauren Meister
- Hon. Oscar Ortiz
- Hon. Daniel Ramos
- Hon. Nick Schultz
- Hon. Jennifer Stark
- Hon. Ali Taj
- Hon. Tamala Takahashi
- Hon. Connor Traut

- Westmoreland*
- Town of Apple Valley*
- Santa Monica*
- Rosemead*
- Signal Hill*
- Santa Paula*
- Westlake Village*
- Yucca Valley*
- Laguna Woods*
- Rolling Hills Estates*
- Huntington Beach*
- Seal Beach*
- Simi Valley*
- West Hollywood*
- Indio*
- Adelanto*
- Burbank*
- Claremont*
- Artesia*
- Burbank*
- Buena Park*

**Imperial County**

- ICTC
- SBCTA
- WSCCOG
- SGVCOG
- GCCOG
- District 47
- LVMCOG
- SBCTA
- OCCOG
- SBCCOG
- OCCOG
- District 20
- VCOG
- Ventura County
- District 41
- CVAG
- SBCTA
- AVCJPA
- SGVCOG
- Presidential Appt.
- SFVCOG
- OCCOG



Hon. Stephanie Virgen	<i>Coachella</i>	CVAG
Hon. Dale Welty	<i>Canyon Lake</i>	WRCOG
Hon. Edward H.J. Wilson	<i>Signal Hill</i>	GCCOG

**Members Not Present**

<b>Hon. Deborah Robertson (Chair)</b>	<b><i>Rialto</i></b>	<b>District 8</b>
Hon. Damon L. Alexander	<i>San Bernardino</i>	SBCTA
Hon. Maria Davila	<i>South Gate</i>	GCCOG
Hon. Carmen Hernandez	<i>Barstow</i>	SANBAG
Hon. Jeannette Sanchez-Palacios	<i>Ventura</i>	VCOG

**CALL TO ORDER AND PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

Vice Chair Luis Plancarte called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m. and Policy Committee member Lauren Meister, West Hollywood, District 41 led the Pledge of Allegiance. Staff confirmed a quorum was present.

**PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD**

Vice Chair Luis Plancarte opened the public comment period and provided detailed instructions on how to provide public comments. He noted that this was the time for members of the public to offer comment for matters that are within SCAG’s jurisdiction but are not listed on the agenda.

He reminded the public to submit comments via email to [EECPublicComment@scag.ca.gov](mailto:EECPublicComment@scag.ca.gov). He noted that public comments received via email after 5:00 p.m. on Wednesday, January 3, 2024, would be announced and included as part of the official record of the meeting.

A member of the public, Mr. John Kindred addressed the committee inquiring about the sustainability of public transportation and the use of wind turbines to generate energy and cut costs.

SCAG staff confirmed there was one public comment that had been received before the 5:00 p.m. deadline on January 3, 2024 for agenda Item No. 5 which had been posted on the website and transmitted to the members.

Seeing there was no further public comment, Vice Chair Plancarte closed the public comment period for matters not listed on the agenda.

**REVIEW AND PRIORITIZE AGENDA ITEMS**

There were no requests to prioritize agenda items.

**CONSENT CALENDAR**

There were no public comments on the Consent Calendar.

Approval Items

1. Minutes of the Meeting – November 2, 2023

Receive and File

2. Energy and Environment Committee Outlook and Future Agenda Items
3. Southern California Clean Cities Coalition Strategic Plan
4. Highways to Boulevards Regional Study

A MOTION was made (Ramos) to approve the Consent Calendar. Motion was SECONDED (Taj) and passed by the following votes:

**AYES:** Beltran, Bishop, Brock, Clark, Copeland, Crosswhite, Davis, Denison, Horne, Huff, D. Kalmick, J. Kalmick, Lopez, Meister, Ortiz, Plancarte, Ramos, Schultz, Stark, Taj, Takahashi, Traut, Virgen and Welty (24)

**NOES:** None (0)

**ABSTAINS:** None (0)

During the roll call vote for the Consent Calendar, Member Litster was inadvertently called on. She was not at a noticed location and, therefore her vote could not be counted.

**ACTION ITEM**

5. Proposed SoCal Greenprint Data Standards

The following members of the public provided comments on agenda Item No. 5.

Melanie Schlotterbeck stated the Greenprint TAC marked a milestone to move forward but she could not fully support Greenprint. She stated that she did not support the change in language

---

regarding data standard A4 and requested changing the wording from 'and' to 'or' or return to the original language the Greenprint Technical Advisory Committee (GTAC) agreed upon.

Manny Kiesser, Friends of Harbors, Beaches and Parks, voiced his support for the Greenprint data standards including the proposed amendments to data standard A4 that was presented by Melanie Schlotterbeck.

Gloria Sefton, Friends of Harbors, Beaches and Parks, voiced her support of Greenprint including the proposed amendments to data standard A4 as presented by Melanie Schlotterbeck.

Elizabeth Wallace, California Native Plant Society, stated her support for the completion of SoCal Greenprint with the proposed amendments to data standard A4 as presented by Melanie Schlotterbeck.

Helen Higgins, Friends of Coyote Hills, stated her support for the proposed amendments to data standard A4 as presented by Melanie Schlotterbeck and urged the completion of Greenprint without further delay.

Chris Wilson, Los Angeles County Business Federation, thanked SCAG staff for their efforts and stated he was looking forward to working with SCAG.

Richard Lambros, Southern California Leadership Council, stated his support for Greenprint and thanked SCAG staff for their efforts.

Art Bishop, Town of Apple Valley, stated he was a member of the GTAC and voiced his support for Greenprint with the inclusion of data standard A4.

There were no further public comments.

Ryan Wolfe, Department Manager of Sustainable and Resilient Development, presented the process of the GTAC. He stated Greenprint was a data tool of publicly available data sources to help assist cities, counties, and transportation agencies to support advanced mitigation, make land use and transportation decisions, and conserve natural farm lands. He stated that the GTAC provided input and consultation for SCAG staff to develop data standards for the SoCal Greenprint tool and acted as an advisory body. He noted that data standards should ensure the trustworthiness of the tool to make sure that the data is high quality. He called on Maggie Messerschmidt to present the specific data standards.

Maggie Messerschmidt, Senior Resilience Consultant from ARUP, stated the key objectives for development of the data standards included sharing alignment with the RAMP policy framework. There were 18 proposed standards which included how to evaluate and communicate the purpose of the data. She provided a description of each data standard before turning the presentation back over to Ryan Wolfe.

Mr. Wolfe presented the draft disclaimer language and stated the first set of language expresses what the intent of the tool is which is for informational purposes only. He shared it recognizes that local land use information is important, and that SCAG does not have land use authority. He stated the second portion of it indicated that there may be more detailed information at the local level and SCAG refers to local jurisdictions who may have more complete information. Lastly, he called on Maggie Messerschmidt to present the data layer identification and evaluation and tool functionality preview.

Policy Committee Member Meister asked Member Art Bishop what was the A4 standard he was in support of and was it based on the last GTAC review.

Policy Committee Member Art Bishop stated it was discussed among staff to use language that would try to make a living document that would be a one stop shop for public users. He stated there were multiple meetings that occurred after the third GTAC meeting to discuss recommendations which is why he was in support.

Policy Committee Member Meister asked which organization offered the language for the A4 data standard and asked if it went back to the other members of the GTAC or other organizations that were involved. She also asked if the data would be included on other public platforms and if the tool would be accessible the public. She further asked if the disclaimer was meant to deter use and asked if SCAG had any other disclaimers on other data tools. She asked what types of data had been left out. She stated she wanted data standard A4 to revert to the original language using 'and or used by regulatory agencies, state and or Federal agencies'.

Policy Committee Member Jenny Crosswhite, Santa Paula, District 47, asked why the language for the A4 data standard stating 'shall' be created by and or sponsored was changed to 'should'. She asked if recommended for use could be added since it was rewritten so that it has to be either created by or sponsored and used. She stated that there may be items that don't fit into those two categories.

Policy Committee Member Daniel Ramos, Adelanto, SBCTA asked if the data that was being exported could be tracked and who was exporting it. Staff acknowledged the question.

Policy Committee member Ali Taj, made a motion to approve staff recommendation and was seconded by Policy Committee member Daniel Ramos. Before taking a vote on the motion the EEC engaged in further discussion on the item.

Policy Committee Member Margaret Clark, Rosemead, District 32, stated she agreed with Melanie Schlotterbeck since the change to the A4 data standard language occurred after the committee met and agreed upon it. She stated that the addition of the word ‘and’ was concerning because if it excluded consideration of parks and green space then that was not what the committee was about. She stated she wanted to make a substitute motion to [change the language] back to ‘created, sponsored or’ rather than ‘and’.

Policy Committee Member Bishop stated he and the majority of members were concerned over producing a document that could be litigated. The disclaimer was purposely added to protect SCAG and other organizations from litigation in the future. He stated there were litigious groups in Southern California and it was the responsibility of the organization to protect city councils and other government institutions.

Policy Committee Member Vianey Lopez, Ventura County, thanked SCAG staff for their efforts and expressed her support for changing the language back to the original recommendation under A4 data standard and keeping the ‘and or used by regulatory agencies.’ She stated it should be open as possible with the data included and reiterated her support of the amended motion.

The comprehensive staff report was included in the agenda packet and posted on the SCAG website. The meeting video is also available on the SCAG website.

A SUBSTITURE MOTION was made (Clark) that the Energy and Environment Committee change the language in the A4 Data Standard from ‘created, sponsored and’ to ‘created, sponsored or’ and recommend the Regional Council (RC) adopt the SoCal Greenprint Recommended Data Standards and update the SCAG Regional Advance Mitigation Program Policy Framework (RAMP Policy Framework). Motion was SECONDED (Lopez).

**AYES:** Beltran, Brock, Clark, Copeland, Crosswhite, Denison, Horne, Huff, D. Kalmick, J. Kalmick, Lopez, Meister, Ortiz, Plancarte, Ramos, Schultz, Stark, Taj, Takahashi, Traut, Virgen, Welty, and Wilson (23)

**NOES:** None (0)

**ABSTAINS:** None (0)

---

## INFORMATION ITEMS

### 6. Connect SoCal 2024: Implementation Strategies

There were no public comments on Item 6.

Ryan Wolfe, Department Manager of Sustainable and Resilient Development, provided a presentation on how implementation strategies will help guide SCAG in implementing the plan. He added that SCAG would not implement projects but rather collaborate and support local partners in implementation. Lastly, he stated implementation strategies were organized by Regional Planning Policy categories within the four Connect SoCal goals of Mobility, Communities, Environment and Economy.

The comprehensive staff report was included in the agenda packet and posted on the SCAG website. The meeting video is also available on the SCAG website.

## CHAIR'S REPORT

Vice Chair Plancarte welcomed Carmen Hernandez, Mayor Pro Tem Barstow, SBCTA and Ali Taj Mayor Pro Tem Artesia, Presidential Appointee to the EEC.

## STAFF REPORT

Rachel Wagner, Government Affairs Officer, reported staff had concluded the Connect SoCal elected officials briefings and outreach. She stated SCAG hosted 15 briefings with elected officials in Imperial, Los Angeles, Orange, Riverside, San Bernardino and Ventura counties. She noted that in all, 229 local elected officials, city and county staff and stakeholders participated in the briefings, where SCAG leadership shared details of the draft Connect SoCal 2024 and discussed implementing the plan's vision for a more resilient and equitable future. Last, she added that the comment period would close on January 12.

## ANNOUNCEMENT

There were no announcements.

**ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, Vice Chair Plancarte adjourned the meeting of the Energy and Environment Committee at 10:42 a.m.

[MINUTES ARE UNOFFICIAL UNTIL APPROVED BY THE EEC]

//



**ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE ATTENDANCE REPORT**

**2023-24**

MEMBERS	Representing	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	April	May	Jun	Total Mtgs Attended To Date
Alexander, Damon L.	San Bernardino, SBCTA	1	1			1	1		0						4
Beltran, Ana	Westmoreland, ICTC	0	0			1	0		1						2
Bishop, Art	Apple Valley, SBCTA	0	1			1	1		1						4
Brock, Phil	Santa Monica, WSCCOG	1	0			1	1		1						4
Clark, Margaret	Rosemead, SGVCOG	1	1			1	1		1						5
Copeland, Robert	Signal Hill, GCCOG	1	0	D		1	1	D	1						4
Crosswhite, Jenny	Santa Paula, District 47	1	1			1	1		1						5
Davila, Maria	South Gate, GCCOG	0	0			0	0		0						0
Davis, Ned	Westlake Village, LVMCOG	0	0			1	1		1						3
Denison, Rick	Yucca Valley, SCBTA	1	1	A		1	1	A	1						5
Hernandez, Carmen	Barstow, SBCTA								0						0
Horne, Shari	Laguna Woods, OCCOG	1	0			1	1		1						4
Huff, Britt	Rolling Hills Estates, SCBCOG	1	1			1	0		1						4
Kalmick, Dan	Huntington Beach, OCCOG	1	1			1	1		1						5
Kalmick, Joe	Seal Beach, District 20	1	1			1	1		1						5
Litster, Elaine	Simi Valley, VCOG	1	1	R		1	1	R	1						5
Lopez, Vianey	Ventura County	1	1			1	1		1						5
Meister, Lauren	West Hollywood, RC District 41	1	1			1	1		1						5
Ortiz, Oscar	Indio, CVAG	1	1			0	1		1						4
Plancarte, Luis	Imperial County	1	1	K		1	1	K	1						5
Ramos, Daniel	Adelanto, SBCTA					1	1		1						3
Robertson, Deborah	Rialto, RC District 8	0	1			1	1		0						3
Sanchez-Palacios, Jeanette	Ventura, VCOG	0	1			1	0		0						2
Schultz, Nick	Burbank, AVCJPA						1		1						2
Stark, Jennifer	Claremont, SGVCOG	1	1			1	1		1						5
Takahashi, Tamala	Burbank, SFVCOG	1	1			1	0		1						4
Traut, Connor	Buena Park, OCCOG	0	1			1	1		1						4
Virgen, Stephanie	Coachella, CVAG	0	1			1	0		1						3
Welty, Dale	Canyon Lake, WRCOG	0	1			1	1		1						4
Wilson, Edward H.J.	Signal Hill, GCCOG	0	0			1	1		1						

Attachment: EEC Attendance Sheet 2022-23 (Minutes of the Meeting - January 4, 2024)